

UNITED STATES DISTRICT COURT  
FOR THE EASTERN DISTRICT OF TEXAS  
TYLER DIVISION

EOLAS TECHNOLOGIES, INC. AND THE  
REGENTS OF THE UNIVERSITY OF  
CALIFORNIA,

*Plaintiffs,*

v.

ADOBE SYSTEMS INC., ET AL.,

*Defendants.*

Civil Action No. 6:09-CV-446 LED

JURY TRIAL DEMANDED

**DEFENDANTS' RESPONSE TO PLAINTIFFS' NOTICE OF SUPPLEMENTAL  
AUTHORITY [D.I. 1225] TO DEFENDANTS' MOTION FOR SUMMARY JUDGMENT  
OF INVALIDITY UNDER 35 U.S.C. § 102(B) [D.I. 869]**

Plaintiffs' notice does not contain new "authority." It is further argument, predicated on a very narrow deposition question asked by Plaintiffs' counsel of one of Defendants' experts, Dr. Phillips. Defendants' motion for summary judgment is predicated on the simple fact that Plaintiffs accused the prior art – Adobe Acrobat – of infringement.<sup>1</sup> In doing so, Plaintiffs' infringement contentions relied on the "default and expected use" of Acrobat, which indisputably includes a PDF file.<sup>2</sup> However, Plaintiffs' corporate designee and the first named inventor testified that he believed Acrobat infringed.<sup>3</sup> Thus, while irrelevant for the motion, Dr. Phillips agreeing that Acrobat "by itself" – i.e., without a PDF file – does not infringe has no bearing on the motion. What does matter, and what Defendants establish in their motion<sup>4</sup> and Dr. Phillips shows without contradiction in his expert report,<sup>5</sup> is that the allegedly infringing Acrobat functionality upon which Plaintiffs rely on in their P. R. 3-1 contentions matches, exactly, the functionality present in Acrobat in June 1993 and which has remain unchanged since.<sup>6</sup>

---

<sup>1</sup> See D.I. 869 at 2-3; D.I. 869-02 (Ex. 1 – Plaintiffs' P. R. 3-1 infringement contentions for the '906 patent) and D.I. 869-03 (Ex. 2 – Plaintiffs' P. R. 3-1 infringement contentions for the '985 patent).]

<sup>2</sup> See, e.g., D.I. 869-02 (at least 53 instances of "PDF files" and 50 instances of "default and expected use") and D.I. 869-03 (at least 83 instances of "PDF files" and 100 instances of "default and expected use").

<sup>3</sup> See D.I. 869-05 (Michael Doyle deposition testimony).

<sup>4</sup> See D.I. 869-07 (Robert Wulff Declaration).

<sup>5</sup> See D.I. 1018-04 (Ex. D – excerpt from 7/20/11 Expert Report on Invalidity)

<sup>6</sup> See D.I. 869 at 6 (Figs. 1 and 2, showing interactivity from P. R. contentions and 1993 Acrobat).

Dated: January 19, 2012

Respectfully submitted,

FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.

By: /s/ David J. Healey

David J. Healey

E-mail: Healey@fr.com

**FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.**

1 Houston Center

1221 McKinney Street, Suite 2800

Houston, TX 77010

(713) 654-5300 (Telephone)

(713) 652-0109 (Facsimile)

OF COUNSEL:

Frank E. Scherkenbach

E-mail: Scherkenbach@fr.com

Proshanto Mukherji

Email: Mukherji@fr.com

**FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.**

One Marina Park Drive

Boston, MA 02110-1878

(617) 542-5070 (Telephone)

(617) 542-8906 (Facsimile)

Jason W. Wolff

E-mail: Wolff@fr.com

**FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.**

12390 El Camino Real

San Diego, CA 92130

(858) 678-5070 (Telephone)

(858) 678-5099 (Facsimile)

Michael E. Florey

Email: florey@fr.com

**FISH & RICHARDSON P.C.**

3200 RBC Plaza

60 South Sixth Street

Minneapolis, MN 55402

(612) 335-5070 (Telephone)

(612) 288-9696 (Facsimile)

Counsel for Defendant

ADOBE SYSTEMS INCORPORATED

/s/ Edward R. Reines (with permission)

Edward R. Reines

Jared Bobrow

Sonal N. Mehta

Aaron Y. Huang

Andrew L. Perito

**WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP**

201 Redwood Shores Parkway

Redwood Shores, CA 94065

Telephone: (650) 802-3000

Facsimile: (650) 802-3100

Email: edward.reines@weil.com

Email: jared.bobrow@weil.com

Email: sonal.mehta@weil.com

Email: aaron.huang@weil.com

Email: andrew.perito@weil.com

Doug W. McClellan

Email: doug.mcclellan@weil.com

**WEIL, GOTSHAL & MANGES LLP**

700 Louisiana, Suite 1600

Houston, TX 77002

Telephone: (713) 546-5000

Facsimile: (713) 224-9511

Jennifer H. Doan

Joshua R. Thane

Shawn A. Latchford

Stephen W. Creekmore, IV

**HALTOM & DOAN**

Crown Executive Center, Suite 100

6500 Summerhill Road

Texarkana, TX 75503

Telephone: (903) 255-1000

Facsimile: (903) 255-0800

Email: jdoan@haltomdoan.com

Email: jthane@haltomdoan.com

Email: slatchford@haltomdoan.com

Email: screekmore@haltomdoan.com

Otis Carroll

Deborah Race

**IRELAND, CARROLL**

**& KELLEY, P.C.**

6101 South Broadway, Suite 500

Tyler, Texas 75703

Telephone: (903) 561-1600

Facsimile: (903) 581-1071

Email: fedserv@icklaw.com

Attorneys for Defendants

**AMAZON.COM INC. AND**

**YAHOO! INC.**

/s/ Thomas L. Duston (with permission)

Thomas L. Duston  
tduston@marshallip.com  
Julianne M. Hartzell  
jhartzell@marshallip.com  
John R. Labbé  
jlabbe@marshallip.com  
Scott A. Sanderson  
ssanderson@marshallip.com  
**MARSHALL, GERSTEIN &  
BORUN LLP**  
6300 Willis Tower  
233 South Wacker Drive  
Chicago, IL 60606-6357  
Telephone: (312) 474-6300  
Facsimile: (312) 474-0448

Eric H. Findlay (Bar No. 00789886)  
efindlay@findlaycraft.com  
Brian Craft (Bar No. 04972020)  
bcraft@findlaycraft.com  
**FINDLAY CRAFT, LLP**  
6760 Old Jacksonville Highway  
Suite 101  
Tyler, TX 75703  
Telephone: (903) 534-1100  
Facsimile: (903) 534-1137

Attorneys for Defendant  
**CDW LLC**

/s/ Proshanto Mukherji (with  
permission)

Thomas M. Melsheimer  
Email: melsheimer@fr.com  
Neil J. McNabney  
Email: mcnabney@fr.com  
Carl E. Bruce  
Email: bruce@fr.com  
**FISH & RICHARDSON**  
1717 Main Street, Suite 5000  
Dallas, TX 75201  
Tel: (214) 474.5070

Proshanto Mukherji  
Email: mukherji@fr.com  
**FISH & RICHARDSON**  
One Marina Park Drive  
Boston, MA 02110-1878  
Telephone: (617) 542-5070

Attorneys for Defendant  
**THE GO DADDY GROUP, INC.**

/s/ Douglas E. Lumish (with  
permission)

Douglas E. Lumish  
Jeffrey G. Homrig  
Joseph H. Lee  
Parker C. Ankrum  
**KASOWITZ, BENSON, TORRES &  
FRIEDMAN, LLP**  
333 Twin Dolphin Drive, Suite 200  
Redwood Shores, CA 94065  
Tel: (650) 453-5170  
Email: dlumish@kasowitz.com  
Email: jhomrig@kasowitz.com  
Email: jlee@kasowitz.com  
Email: pankrum@kasowitz.com

Jonathan K. Waldrop  
**KASOWITZ, BENSON, TORRES &  
FRIEDMAN, LLP**  
1360 Peachtree St., N.E.  
Suite 1150  
Atlanta, GA 30309  
Tel: (404) 260-6080  
Email: jwaldrop@kasowitz.com

James R. Batchelder  
Sasha G. Rao  
Brandon H. Stroy  
Rebecca R. Hermes  
Lauren N. Robinson  
**ROPES & GRAY LLP**  
1900 University Avenue, 6th Floor  
East Palo Alto, CA 94303-2284  
Tel: (650) 617-4000  
Email:  
james.batchelder@ropesgray.com  
Email: sasha.rao@ropesgray.com  
Email: brandon.stroy@ropesgray.com  
Email: lauren.robinson@ropesgray.com  
Email: rebecca.hermes@ropesgray.com

Han Xu  
**ROPES & GRAY LLP**  
Prudential Tower, 800 Boylston St.  
Boston, MA 02199-3600  
Tel: (617) 951-7000  
Email: han.xu@ropesgray.com

Daryl Joseffer

Adam Conrad  
**KING & SPALDING**  
1700 Pennsylvania Avenue, NW  
Suite 200  
Washington, DC 2006-4707  
Tel: (202) 737-0500  
Email: djoeffe@kslaw.com  
Email: aconrad@kslaw.com

Michael E. Jones  
Allen F. Gardner  
**POTTER MINTON**  
110 N. College, Suite 500  
Tyler, TX 75702  
Tel: (903) 597-8311  
Email: mikejones@potterminton.com  
Email: allengardner@potterminton.com

ATTORNEYS FOR DEFENDANTS  
**GOOGLE INC. AND YOUTUBE  
LLC**

/s/ Christopher M. Joe (with  
permission)  
Christopher M. Joe  
Brian Carpenter  
Eric W. Buether  
**BUETHER JOE & CARPENTER**  
1700 Pacific, Suite 2390  
Dallas, TX 75201  
Tel: (214) 466-1270  
Chris.Joe@BJCIPLaw.com  
Eric.Buether@BJCIPLaw.com  
Brian.Carpenter@BJCIPLaw.com

Attorneys for Defendant  
**J.C. PENNEY CORPORATION,  
INC.**

/s/ Donald R. Steinberg (with  
permission)  
Mark Matuschak  
Donald R. Steinberg  
Alexandra Boudreau  
**WILMER CUTLER PICKERING  
HALE AND DORR, LLP**  
60 State Street  
Boston, MA 02109  
Tel. (617) 526.5000  
mark.matuschak@wilmerhale.com  
don.steinberg@wilmerhale.com

silena.paik@wilmerhale.com

Kate Hutchins  
**WILMER CUTLER PICKERING  
HALE AND DORR, LLP**  
399 Park Avenue  
New York, NY 10022  
Tel: (212) 230.8800  
kate.hutchins@wilmerhale.com

Daniel V. Williams  
**WILMER CUTLER PICKERING  
HALE AND DORR, LLP**  
1875 Pennsylvania Avenue, N.W.  
Washington, D.C. 20006  
202.663.6012  
daniel.williams@wilmerhale.com

Joe W. Redden, Jr.  
Michael E. Richardson  
**BECK REDDEN & SECREST**  
1221 McKinney  
Suite 4500  
Houston, TX 77010  
Tel: (713) 951.6284  
mrichardson@brsfirm.com  
jredden@brsfirm.com

Attorneys for Defendant  
**STAPLES, INC.**



**CERTIFICATE OF SERVICE**

The undersigned hereby certifies that a true and correct copy of the above and foregoing document has been served on January 19, 2011 to all counsel of record who are deemed to have consented to electronic service via the Court's CM/ECF system per Local Rule CV-5(a)(3).

/s/ Jason W. Wolff

11195130.doc